

Tracking Predictable Drifting Parameters of a Time Series

Joint work with Eduard Belitser

Paulo Serra

Department of Mathematics and Computer Science
Eindhoven University of Technology

12th September, 2013

Model Description

Assume we observed $\mathbf{X}_n = (X_0, X_1, \dots, X_n)$ following:

$$X_0 \sim \mathbb{P}_0, \quad X_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1} \sim \mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}), \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

- X_k takes values in $\mathcal{X} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^l$, $l \in \mathbb{N}$ (i.e. $\mathbb{P}(X_k \in \mathcal{X}) = 1$).
- The distribution of \mathbf{X}_n , $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$, is given by

$$\mathbb{P}^{(n)} = \mathbb{P}^{(n)}(\mathbf{x}_n) = \prod_{k=0}^n \mathbb{P}_k(x_k | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}), \quad \mathbf{x}_k \in \mathcal{X}^{k+1},$$

where $\mathbb{P}_0(x_0 | \mathbf{x}_{-1})$ should be understood as $\mathbb{P}_0(x_0)$.

- At time $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$, the underlying growing statistical model is $\mathcal{P}^{(n)} = \left\{ \prod_{k=0}^n \mathbb{P}_k(x_k | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}) : \mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}) \in \mathcal{P}_k \right\}$.

Objective

- Consider a filtration $\{\mathcal{F}_k\}_{k=-1}^{\infty}$ such that $\mathcal{F}_k \subseteq \sigma(\mathbf{X}_k)$.
- Consider a sequence of appropriately measurable operators A_k , which map measures $\mathbb{P}_k(\cdot|\mathbf{x}_{k-1}) \in \mathcal{P}_k$

$$A_k(\mathbb{P}_k(\cdot|\mathbf{x}_{k-1})) = \theta_k(\mathbf{x}_{k-1}), \quad \mathbf{x}_{k-1} \in \mathcal{X}^{k-1},$$

with $\theta_k(\mathbf{x}_{k-1})$ predictable with respect to \mathcal{F}_k .

Objective

We would like to track $\theta_k = \theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1})$.

Definition of the Algorithm

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

Assumption (A0)

The drifting parameter satisfies $\mathbb{P}(\theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1}) \in \Theta)$ for some Θ such that $\sup_{\theta \in \Theta} \|\theta\|^2 \leq C_\Theta$.

The following algorithm constitutes our tracking sequence.

Tracking Algorithm

Define $\hat{\theta}_{k+1} = \hat{\theta}_k + \gamma_k G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k)$, $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$ where $0 \leq \gamma_k \leq \Gamma$ and arbitrary \mathcal{F}_{-1} -measurable $\hat{\theta}_0 \in \Theta \subset \mathbb{R}^d$.

The functions $G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k)$ are called **gain vectors**.

Assumptions on the Gain Function

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

Assumption (A1)

For all $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$, constants λ_1, λ_2 and $\theta_k = A_k(\mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}))$,

$$g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k) = g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) = \mathbb{E}[G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k) | \mathcal{F}_{k-1}],$$

exists; for a \mathcal{F}_{k-1} -measurable symmetric PD matrix \mathbf{M}_k , a.s.

$$g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) = -\mathbf{M}_k(\hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k),$$

$$0 < \lambda_1 \leq \mathbb{E}[\lambda_{(1)}(\mathbf{M}_k) | \mathcal{F}_{k-2}] \leq \lambda_{(d)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_2 < \infty.$$

Assumption (A2)

There exists a constant $C_g > 0$ such that

$$\mathbb{E}\|G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k) - g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1})\|^2 \leq C_g, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0.$$

Main Results

L_1 risk bound

Theorem (Bound on L_1 risk)

Let (A0) – (A2) hold and $\delta_k = \delta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1}) = \hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k$, $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$. Then for any $k_0, k \in \mathbb{N}_0$ and sequence $\{\gamma_k, k \in \mathbb{N}_0\}$ (satisfying the conditions of the previous lemma) such that $\gamma_i \lambda_2 \leq 1$, $i \in \{k_0, \dots, k\}$, the following relation holds:

$$\mathbb{E} \|\delta_{k+1}\| \leq C_1 \exp \left\{ -\frac{\lambda_1}{2} \sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i \right\} + C_2 \left[\sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i^2 \right]^{1/2} + C_3 \max_{k_0 \leq i \leq k} \mathbb{E} \|\theta_{i+1} - \theta_{k_0}\|, \quad k_0 \leq k,$$

where $C_1 = \sqrt{2}(\bar{C}_\Theta + C_\Theta)^{1/2}$, $C_2 = C_g^{1/2}(1 + \lambda_2/\lambda_1)$, $C_3 = (1 + \lambda_2/\lambda_1)$.

Stronger Assumptions on the Gain Function

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

Assumption (A1)

$$g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) = -\mathbf{M}_k(\hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k).$$

$$0 < \lambda_1 \leq \mathbb{E}[\lambda_{(1)}(\mathbf{M}_k) | \mathcal{F}_{k-2}] \leq \lambda_{(d)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_2 < \infty, \quad (\text{a.s.})$$



$$0 < \lambda_1 \leq \lambda_{(1)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_{(d)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_2 < \infty, \quad (\text{a.s.})$$

Assumption (A2)

$$\mathbb{E} \|G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k) - g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1})\|^2 \leq C_g, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0.$$



$$\|G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k)\|^2 \leq C_g, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0, \quad (\text{a.s.})$$

Main Results

L_p risk bound

Theorem (L_p risk bound)

Suppose that the conditions of the previous theorem are fulfilled. If, in addition (to assumption (A1)), $\lambda_{(1)}(\mathbf{M}_i) \geq \lambda_1$ and $\|G_i(\hat{\theta}_i, \mathbf{X}_i)\| \leq C_g$ (instead of (A2)) a.s. for all $i = k_0 \dots, k$, then for any $p \geq 1$

$$\mathbb{E} \|\delta_{k+1}\|_p^p \leq C'_1 \exp \left\{ -p\lambda_1 \sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i \right\} + C'_2 \left[\sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i^2 \right]^{p/2} \\ + C'_3 \max_{k_0 \leq i \leq k} \mathbb{E} \|\theta_{i+1} - \theta_{k_0}\|_p^p, \quad k_0 \leq k,$$

for $C'_1 = 3^{p-1} K_p^p \mathbb{E} \|\delta_{k_0}\|_p^p$, $C'_2 = 3^{p-1} 2^p d B_p C_g^p (1 + K_p^2 \lambda_2 / \lambda_1)^p$, $C'_3 = 3^{p-1} (1 + K_p^2 \lambda_2 / \lambda_1)^p$, and K_p and B_p are constants.

Lipschitz Signal: $\theta_k^n = \vartheta(k/n)$, $\vartheta(\cdot) \in \mathcal{L}_\beta$

$$\mathbb{E} \|\delta_{k+1}\| \lesssim \exp \left\{ -\frac{\lambda_1}{2} \sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i \right\} + \left[\sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i^2 \right]^{1/2} + \max_{k_0 \leq i \leq k} \mathbb{E} \|\theta_{i+1} - \theta_{k_0}\|,$$

$$\mathbb{E} \|\delta_{k+1}\|_p^p \lesssim \exp \left\{ -p\lambda_1 \sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i \right\} + \left[\sum_{i=k_0}^k \gamma_i^2 \right]^{p/2} + \max_{k_0 \leq i \leq k} \mathbb{E} \|\theta_{i+1} - \theta_{k_0}\|_p^p,$$

$$X_0^n \sim P_{\theta_0^n}, \quad X_k^n | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}^n \sim \mathbb{P}_{\theta_k^n}(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}^n), \quad k \leq n \in \mathbb{N},$$

- Assume that $\theta_k^n = \vartheta(k/n)$, with $\vartheta(\cdot) \in \mathcal{L}_\beta$, $k = 1, \dots, n$.
- For $0 < \beta \leq 1$, $\gamma_k \equiv C_\gamma (\log n)^{(2\beta-1)/(2\beta+1)} n^{-2\beta/(2\beta+1)}$, $k_0 = K_n = (\log n)^{2/(2\beta+1)} n^{2\beta/(2\beta+1)}$ we get

$$\sup_{\substack{\vartheta \in \mathcal{L}_\beta \\ k \geq K_n}} \mathbb{E} \frac{n^{-\frac{\beta}{2\beta+1}} \|\delta_k\|}{(\log n)^{\frac{2\beta}{2\beta+1}}} \leq C \quad \text{and} \quad \sup_{\substack{\vartheta \in \mathcal{L}_\beta \\ k \geq K_n}} \mathbb{E} \left(\frac{n^{-\frac{\beta}{2\beta+1}} \|\delta_k\|_p}{(\log n)^{\frac{2\beta}{2\beta+1}}} \right)^p \leq C.$$

Example 1

Signal + noise setting

The model is:

$$\mathbf{X}_k = \theta_k + \xi_k, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0,$$

where $\{\theta_k\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}_0}$ is a predictable process ($\theta_k = \theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1})$), $\{\xi_k\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}_0}$ is a martingale difference noise with respect to the filtration $\{\mathcal{F}_k\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}_{-1}}$.

We can simply take the following gain function

$$G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k) = -(\hat{\theta}_k - X_k), \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0,$$

since

$$g_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \theta_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) = \mathbb{E}[G_k(\hat{\theta}_k, \mathbf{X}_k) | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}] = -(\hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k), \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0.$$

General Gain Construction

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

- Assume each measure in $\mathcal{P}_k = \{P_\theta(x|\mathbf{X}_{k-1}), \theta \in \Theta \subset \mathbb{R}^d\}$ has a density $p_\theta(x|\mathbf{X}_{k-1})$, $\theta \in \Theta$, with respect to some σ -finite dominating measure.
- Assume also that there is a common support \mathcal{X} for these densities, and that for any $x \in \mathcal{X}$, $\mathbf{x}_{k-1} \in \mathcal{X}^{k-1}$, and $\theta \in \Theta$, the partial derivatives $\partial p_\theta(x|\mathbf{x}_{k-1})/\partial \theta_i$, $i = 1, \dots, d$, exist and are finite.
- Let $\nabla_\theta \log p_\theta(x|\mathbf{x}_{k-1})$ be a gradient.

General Gain Construction

We can use the gains

$$G_k(\vartheta, \mathbf{x}_k) = \nabla_{\vartheta} \log p_{\vartheta}(x_k | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}).$$

If expectation and differentiation can be interchanged, then

$$\begin{aligned} g_k(\vartheta, \theta | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) &= \mathbb{E}_{\theta} [\nabla_{\vartheta} \log p_{\vartheta}(X_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}] \\ &= \nabla_{\vartheta} \mathbb{E}_{\theta} [\log p_{\vartheta}(X_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}) | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}] \\ &= -\nabla_{\vartheta} KL(P_{\theta}(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}), P_{\vartheta}(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1})). \end{aligned}$$

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

Motivation

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

- In quantile regression we estimate a **conditional quantile** (rather than conditional expectation) of one random variable given another.
- **More robust** than regression: no moment assumptions.
- Estimating **multiple quantiles simultaneously** gives more comprehensive picture of the distribution.
- Relevant in econometrics, social sciences and ecology.
- Relation between response variable and the measured predictors might be complex and not be captured by the conditional expectation.

Notion of Depth

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

- Multidimensional analogues of the median, center points of a distribution, can be defined using a **depth function**.
- Given \mathbb{P} with support in \mathbb{R}^d , the depth of $x \in \mathbb{R}^d$ with respect to \mathbb{P} , $DF(x, \mathbb{P})$, measures the **centrality** of x in \mathbb{P} .
- Depth functions should give a \mathbb{P} -based, **center-outward ordering** of the points $x \in \mathbb{R}^d$ via contours of the function $x \mapsto DF(x, \mathbb{P})$.
- Points of **maxima of the depth function** $DF(x, \mathbb{P})$ will be the “**most central**” points of the distribution \mathbb{P} .

Properties of the Half-Space Depth

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

- Tukey's notion of depth, the **half-space depth**, is defined as

$$DF(x, \mathbb{P}) = \inf \left\{ \mathbb{P}(H) : H \text{ is a closed half-space, } x \in H \right\}.$$

- In one dimension, points of maximum half-space depth are, by definition, medians.
- The half-space depth has attractive **properties**, namely:
 - it is invariant under affine transformations;
 - for distributions with a natural notion of center, it attains its maximum at this center;
 - it decays monotonically relative to its deepest point;
 - it vanishes at infinity.

Half-Space Symmetrical Distributions

Quantiles and spatial medians

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

- We work with distributions for which there is a proper notion of center.
- Absolutely continuous distributions \mathbb{P} which are **half-space symmetric about θ** :

$$\theta \in H \Rightarrow \mathbb{P}(H) \geq 1/2, \quad H \text{ is a closed half-space.}$$

- In one dimension, for $\alpha \in [0, 1/2)$,

$$\begin{aligned}\theta(\alpha) &= \inf\{x \in \mathbb{R} : DF(x, \mathbb{P}) \geq \alpha\}, \\ \theta(1 - \alpha) &= \sup\{x \in \mathbb{R} : DF(x, \mathbb{P}) \geq \alpha\},\end{aligned}$$

- In d dimensions, $d \geq 1$,

$$\theta(1/2) = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^d : DF(x, \mathbb{P}) \geq 1/2\}.$$

Model

Assume we observe $\mathbf{X}_n = (X_0, X_1, \dots, X_n)$ according to:

$$X_0 \sim \mathbb{P}_0, \quad X_k | \mathbf{X}_{k-1} \sim \mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1}), \quad k \in \mathbb{N},$$

where these conditional measures have support $\mathcal{X} \subset \mathbb{R}^d$.

Objective

Given $\alpha_k \in (0, 1)$, $k \in \mathbb{N}$, we would like to track $\theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1}, \alpha_k)$.

If $d = 1$ we track $\theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1}, \alpha_k)$, the **conditional quantile of level α_k** of $\mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1})$.

If $d \geq 2$ we fix $\alpha_k = 1/2$, $k \in \mathbb{N}$, and track $\theta_k(\mathbf{X}_{k-1}, 1/2)$, the **conditional spatial median** of $\mathbb{P}_k(\cdot | \mathbf{X}_{k-1})$.

Assumptions

Let $H(x, w)$ be the half-space containing $x + w$, delimited by the hyper-plane which contains x and is perpendicular to w .

Assumption (B1)

For $b, B, \delta > 0$, any $\epsilon \in (0, \delta]$, any unit vectors $v, w \in \mathbb{R}^d$:

$$b \leq \frac{\mathbb{P}_k(H(\theta_k - \epsilon v, w) | \mathbf{x}_{k-1}) - \alpha_k}{v^T w \epsilon} \leq B, \mathbf{x}_k \in \mathcal{X}^k,$$

where $k \in \mathbb{N}$, $\theta_k = \theta_k(\mathbf{x}_{k-1}, \alpha_k)$ as before.

Assumption (B2)

The support \mathcal{X} is a **compact** set, such that for all $x \in \mathcal{X}$, $\|x\| \leq C_{\mathcal{X}}$ and the conditional spatial quantiles θ_k take values in some convex subset $\Theta \subseteq \mathcal{X}$ with $\|\theta\| \leq C_{\Theta}$, $\theta \in \Theta$.

Definition of the Gains and Algorithms

Tracking
Predictable
Drifting
Parameters
of a Time
Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of
Parameter
Variation

Construction
of Gain
Functions

Application:
Quantile
Tracking

References

Proposed Gains

- For $d = 1$ $u \in \mathcal{X}$, $v \in \mathbb{R}$ and $\alpha \in (0, 1)$

$$R(u, v, \alpha) = \alpha - I\{u \leq v\}, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

- For $d \geq 2$, $u \in \mathcal{X} \subset \mathbb{R}^d$, $v \in \mathbb{R}^d$ and $w \in \mathbb{R}^d$ a unit vector

$$S(u, v, w) = w \left(I\{u \in H(v, w)\} - 1/2 \right), \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

Let $B = \{e_1, \dots, e_d\}$ be an orthonormal basis for \mathbb{R}^d . Call D such that $\mathbb{P}(D = e_i) = 1/d$, $i = 1, \dots, d$, a **random direction**.

Definition of the Gains and Algorithms

Proposed Gains

- For $d = 1$ $u \in \mathcal{X}$, $v \in \mathbb{R}$ and $\alpha \in (0, 1)$

$$R(u, v, \alpha) = \alpha - I\{u \leq v\}, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

- For $d \geq 2$, $u \in \mathcal{X} \subset \mathbb{R}^d$, $v \in \mathbb{R}^d$ and $w \in \mathbb{R}^d$ a unit vector

$$S(u, v, w) = w \left(I\{u \in H(v, w)\} - 1/2 \right), \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

Proposed Algorithms

- For $d = 1$, $\alpha_k \in (0, 1)$, $k \in \mathbb{N}$,

$$\hat{\theta}_{k+1} = \hat{\theta}_k + \gamma_k R(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, \alpha_k), \quad \hat{\theta}_1 \in \Theta, \quad k \in \mathbb{N},$$

- For $d \geq 2$ and D_k a sequence of i.i.d. random directions

$$\hat{\theta}_{k+1} = \hat{\theta}_k + \gamma_k S(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, D_k), \quad \hat{\theta}_1 \in \Theta, \quad k \in \mathbb{N},$$

Preliminary Results

Verifying assumption (A1) and assumption (A2)

Lemma (Representation $d = 1$)

A.s. $\|R(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, \alpha_k)\| \leq 1$. If (B1) and (B2) hold, then

$$\mathbb{E}[R(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, \alpha_k) | \mathcal{F}_{k-1}] = -M_k(\hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k), \quad k \in \mathbb{N},$$

with $\mathcal{F}_{k-1} = \sigma(\mathbf{D}_{k-1}, \mathbf{X}_{k-1})$, for \mathcal{F}_{k-1} -measurable random variables M_k such that a.s. $0 < \lambda_1 \leq M_k \leq \lambda_2 < \infty$.

Lemma (Representation $d \geq 2$)

A.s. $\|S(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, D_k)\| \leq 1/2$. If (B1) and (B2) hold, then

$$\mathbb{E}[S(X_k, \hat{\theta}_k, D_k) | \mathcal{F}_{k-1}] = -\mathbf{M}_k(\hat{\theta}_k - \theta_k), \quad k \in \mathbb{N},$$

with $\mathcal{F}_{k-1} = \sigma(\mathbf{D}_{k-1}, \mathbf{X}_{k-1})$, for \mathcal{F}_{k-1} -measurable matrices \mathbf{M}_k such that a.s. $0 < \lambda_1 \leq \lambda_{(1)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_{(d)}(\mathbf{M}_k) \leq \lambda_2 < \infty$.

References

Tracking Predictable Drifting Parameters of a Time Series

Paulo Serra

The Model

Results

Examples of Parameter Variation

Construction of Gain Functions

Application: Quantile Tracking

References

References

- G. Bassett and R. Koenker, **Asymptotic theory of least absolute error regression**, *JASA*, 73(363):618–622, 1978.
- E. Belitser and P. Serra, **On properties of the algorithm for pursuing a drifting quantile**, *Automation and Remote Control*, 74(4):613–627, 2013.
- E. Belitser and P. Serra, **Online Tracking of a Predictable Drifting Parameter of a Time Series**, arXiv:1306.0325 [math.ST], 2013.
- E. Belitser and P. Serra, **Tracking of a Conditional Spatial Median**, pre-print, 2013.
- R. Koenker, **Quantile Regression**, Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- H. J. Kushner and G. Yin, **Stochastic Approximation and Recursive Algorithms and Applications**, Berlin and New York: Springer-Verlag, 2003.
- H. Robbins and S. Monro, **A stochastic approximation method**, *The Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, 22(3):400–407, 1951.
- J. W. Tukey, **Mathematics and the picturing of data**, *Proceedings of the international congress of mathematicians*, volume 2, pages 523–531, 1975.
- M. T. Wasan, **Stochastic Approximation**, Cambridge University Press, 1969.
- Y. Zuo and R. Serfling, **General notions of statistical depth function**, *Annals of Statistics*, pages 461–482, 2000.