Paper X

Title of Manuscript:

Which category describes this manuscript?

- ❑ Practice/Application/Case
- ❑ Study/Experience Report
- ❑ Research/Technology
- ❑ Survey/Tutorial/How-To
- ❑ Other (please specify): ……………..

Are the title, the abstract and the introduction appropriate? Please comment.

Title		Abstract		Introduction
❑ Yes	❑	Yes	❑	Yes
❑ No	❑	No	❑	No

Explain:………..……………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………

Discuss the contribution made by the manuscript:

Explain:………..……………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………

Rate the paper in each of the following areas (1 = low ; 4 = high):

	1	2	3	4
Technical content	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………..
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………
………………………………………………………………………………………………

Business content	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………..

………
………
………
………

	1	2	3	4
Originality of claim	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain ……………………………………………………………………………………………..
………
………
………
………
………………………………………………

Statements are exaggerated   YES / NO

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………………………..
………
………
………
………
…………………………………………

	1	2	3	4
Clarity and Organisation	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain ……………………………………………………………………………………………..
………
………
………
………

	1	2	3	4
Writing style/Grammar	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain ……………………………………………………………………………………………..
………
………
………
………

COMMENTS ON SCIENTIFIC REASONING

Rate the paper in each of the following areas (1 = low ; 4 = high):

Claim:

	1	2	3	4
Well-formulated	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
………

| All concepts are explained | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ |

Explain ……
………
……

| Generic (1) vs. concrete (4) | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ |

Explain ……………………………………………………………………………………………..

………
………
………

Reasoning:

	1	2	3	4
Well-structured	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………………
………
………
………

	1	2	3	4
Shallow (1) vs. profound	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………………
………
………
………
……………………………

Enough sound examples	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………………..
………
………
………
……………………………

Generic (1) vs. concrete (4)	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain ……………………………………
………
………
………
………………………………

Conclusion:

	1	2	3	4
Based on logical reasoning	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain ………………………………………………………………………………………….
………
………
………
…………………………

Contains new elements (1=yes, 4=no)	❏	❏	❏	❏

Explain ………………………………………………………………………………………….
………
………
………..

Does the manuscript contain sufficient and appropriate references? Please comment.

	NO			YES
Sufficient references	❑	❑	❑	❑

Explain …………………………………………………………………………………………..
……

| References in conference style | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ |

Explain   ………………………………………………………………………………………..
……

| References where appropriate | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ | ❑ |

Explain   ………………………………………………………………………………………..
……

Suggestions for improvement to the paper:

……
……
……
……